

1. ECONOMIC GROWTH CLUSTER

Goal 8: Decent work and economic growth

Gap Summary

Pertaining to work:

- Discrimination (gender, race & religion).
- Forced child labour, especially of those who did not have opportunity to continue their studies.
- There is still violations of workers' rights, for example, sexual harassment, unreasonable pay.
- Work given is not same with what was offered, even resulting in human trafficking.
- Most employments are concentrated in the city area, causing migration of indigenous peoples from villages to the city.
- Many indigenous peoples still do not have the opportunity to improve their skills and education, making it difficult for them to get better jobs.

Pertaining to economic growth:

- Indigenous peoples do not have the opportunity to determine the direction of economic development that is in accordance with their way of life, taking into account their resources, knowledge and technology.
- For indigenous peoples that are interested in involving themselves in businesses, for example ecotourism, the risk is high if it is managed by parties outside of the community.
- The gap in economic status between indigenous peoples in cities and those outside cities is gradually widening, causing the existence of classification among indigenous people.
- Recruitment of foreign workers on a large scale with the excuse of there being not enough workers and local workers being unskilled.

Recommendation Summary

- Disaggregation of GDP data percentages that show the total number of those who are unemployed and employed among indigenous peoples.
- Re-examine economic policies in order to improve the economic situation of indigenous peoples, especially those who live in rural areas.
- Conduct programmes to improve the skills and capabilities of indigenous peoples so that they may be able to compete in the job market.
- More facilities provided for small-scale businesses. For example, financial aid for start-up capital.
- Give recognition to indigenous land to enable them to establish small-scale industries.

Goal 9: Industry, Innovation & Infrastructure

Gap Summary

- Aid and support to indigenous peoples for conducting research on resources and their innovations have not been given attention.
- Indigenous peoples have been manipulated and their traditional knowledge, technology, and resources taken. For example, indigenous knowledge has been stolen and patented by others (bio-piracy).
- Information and research data by outsiders have been manipulated for certain interests.

Recommendation Summary

- Rights to research done by indigenous peoples themselves.
- Recognition and support from the government to indigenous people in their research.

Goal 11: Sustainable Cities & Communities

Gap Summary

- Low cost and affordable houses or PPRT (Hardcore Poor Housing Project) houses that have been built are not resilient.

- Definition of 'squatter' used to violate indigenous rights - no official documents or recognition to their settlements/customary land.
- Indigenous peoples receive little information on government housing schemes or programmes such as My First Home & My Deposit.
- It is difficult to apply for housing like Rumah Mesra Rakyat (RMR) because it requires supporting documents such as land grants to allow applications to be approved.
- There are incidents of bribery and abuse of power in PPRT & RMR construction projects - cronyism, favouritism according to political support, misappropriation of funds and project materials.
- Indigenous peoples are not involved in the planning and design of PPRT houses.

Recommendation Summary

- Indigenous peoples are involved in the planning, design and implementation of PPRT, RMR, or long houses that are appropriate with their culture.
- Provide programmes for the exposure to and promotion of housing schemes that are available to indigenous peoples.
- The definition of 'squatter' should not be used to label indigenous communities that live on their customary land.

Goal 17: Partnerships for the Goals

Gap Summary

- There is no involvement from indigenous peoples in the formulation of Malaysia's SDG roadmap.
- Indigenous peoples will continue to be left out and uninvolved in the planning of the country's macro-economy.

Recommendation Summary

- Indigenous peoples should be included in planning the country's economy.
- Cooperation of the government to ensure that communities are involved in planning the economy.

2. ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES CLUSTER

Goal 6: Clean Water and Sanitation

Concerns:

1. Current data given by the EPU is inaccurate and needs to be updated as well as disaggregated according to data from city, rural and interior areas with attention to the reality of water issues faced by indigenous peoples.
2. It must be emphasized that data is not only on connection to piped water but that there is enough uninterrupted supply of water (24/7) for every house
3. The goal should be to provide free access to clean water and sanitation, as water should not be commoditized as it is a fundamental life necessity.
4. Suggestions for the improvement of water treatment technology in the EPU plan can cause a hike in water costs that will be a burden on the public, especially those who have already been left behind, a majority of them indigenous peoples.
5. Water treatment methods that are dependent on the excess use of chlorine is a danger to health.
6. Project to provide water supply, including water catchment areas and building of gravity water centres can be privatized, taken over by companies or GLCs and the cost will borne by villagers. There is already an example where the government has taken the opportunity where they built gravity pipes but the cost of water is paid by the villagers.

Recommendations:

1. Recognition and support has to be given to customary land and indigenous Native Customary Rights (NCR) for the conservation of water catchments and rivers (water resources are important in the rural and interior areas).
2. Indigenous peoples can share their traditional knowledge on ways to collect clean rainwater and also their experience in building a good and clean gravity water centre.
3. Rather than building dams, supplying pipes or supplying chlorinated water, the government can provide allocation for the building of gravity water centres that can guarantee clean water.

- Suggestions for clean water indicators:
 - Water sampling is done twice a year in water resources and at every home by communities with independent bodies (once during rainy season and another during dry season) to analyze the water composition comprehensively and allow action to be taken immediately to ensure clean water is provided and supplied.
 - Statistics on the level of health among indigenous peoples based on water usage (whether due to lack of water supply or polluted water).
- Suggestions of indicators for access to clean water and sanitation:
 - No. of households that have sufficient supply of clean water 24/7.
 - No. of gravity water centres that are functioning well in every community area/village according to district.
 - No. of rain water catchment areas that can supply clean and sufficient water.
 - No. of water catchment areas and gravity water centres managed by indigenous peoples themselves, with there being technical expertise in the community - for example, there is a water catchment/gravity water centre committee.

Goal 7: Clean and affordable energy

Concerns:

1. The data has to differentiate from areas where there are electric poles but there is no supply of electricity.
2. Data from Sarawak has not been included in the EPU plan.
3. The definition of 'clean energy' that includes nuclear energy/mega dams cannot be accepted because its sustainability and safety cannot be ensured.
4. Energy projects must be ensured to be safe and clean by EIAs and environmental and social safeguards beforehand and cannot affect indigenous rights, especially to land.

5. Dam construction as 'clean energy' will cause discrimination of indigenous peoples' rights to land and their displacement. This will affect their livelihoods, culture and traditions.

Recommendations:

1. Micro hydro systems can be a source of cheap and clean energy for rural and interior areas, and also help take care of water catchment areas.
2. The government can provide allocation to help NGOs like Tonibung in their micro hydro projects.
3. Reliable and efficient **use** of electricity instead of mere 'access':
 - Indicator suggestions:
 - No. of households that receive sufficient, effective and efficient supply of electricity 24/7.
 - No. of complaints from each household in a village/community about disrupted electricity supply.
 - Involvement of expert NGOs like Tonibung in providing clean and cheap energy.
 - No. of energy projects that are managed by indigenous peoples themselves, with there being technical expertise in the community - for example, there is a micro hydro committee in each village.
 - Clean energy indicator suggestions:
 - Only energy projects that have been ensured to be in line with comprehensive environmental and social safeguards and a free and transparent EIA can be conducted. Consent must involve indigenous peoples according to recognition of indigenous rights, FPIC and UNDRIP.

Goal 12: Responsible consumption and production

Concerns:

1. Strategy stated in the EPU plan is not clear/too general.

2. There is no recognition and support given to subsistence economy/self-sufficiency/small scale-community owned production in achieving this goal.
3. Standards of sustainable and responsible production should include the fair and equitable sharing of benefits with indigenous peoples. Simultaneously, standards of sustainable and responsible consumption should not deprive the livelihoods and wellbeing of indigenous peoples – those who are already in need and left behind.
4. The principle of equity and differential treatment should be adopted in regard to responsible consumption- whereby indigenous peoples and those in need should have increased access to sufficient resources for the fulfillment of their needs and wellbeing.
5. The phrase ‘complex and diverse products’ stated in the EPU plan is not clear. The production would not necessarily bring benefits, and may even increase the use of imported products.
6. The control of use and production may be targeted at groups who are already lacking/small industries - this can threaten the well-being indigenous peoples.
7. The overproduction of food products will not solve hunger/starvation problems.

Recommendations:

1. Sustainable Production and Consumption Blueprint should be made public early on in line with the principle of inclusiveness and transparency.
2. The government can recognize and give support to the subsistence economy that is practiced by indigenous peoples.
 - Indicator suggestions:
 - No. of communities that can support themselves through farming and their own production.
 - The flourishing of thriving community and small scale economic production- based on a combination of barter, trade, gift and monetary exchange systems (many of which are customary and traditional forms of economy that the indigenous practice).
3. There must be full and comprehensive compliance with environmental and social safeguards, EIAs, protection of human rights, workers rights, migrant rights, indigenous rights etc. This itself should be an indicator of responsible production.
 - Indicator suggestions:

- Strong legislation and effective enforcement of environmental laws as well as on human rights, migrant rights, workers rights etc, on all private sector and public sector production in the country, including MNCs.
4. Control in production should be focused in large-scale industries and companies.
 5. This goal must include efforts to tackle waste problems - waste segregation, reducing, upcycling, recycling, composting etc.
 - Indicator suggestions:
 - Establishment and effective implementation of proper waste disposal and segregation systems nationwide, especially in rural and interior/coastal areas.

Goal 13: Climate Action

Concerns:

1. The strategy formulated does not involve indigenous peoples.
2. Local climate change with its effect on indigenous livelihoods should also be taken into account.

Recommendations:

1. Indigenous peoples can share their methods on adapting to climate change, and the government should recognize and promote such practices. For example:
 - The practice of keeping and sharing seeds to protect food security.
 - Agriculture based on integrated farming (and not monocrop).
 - Planting according to seasons.
2. Implementation of the National Climate Policy (NCP) that is in line with the country's commitment to the UNFCCC and Paris Agreement has to be included in the action plan.

- Indicator suggestions:
 - Independent studies on the effectiveness of climate action programs with a focus on the resilience of indigenous people and marginalized communities as a fundamental indicator of successful climate action program.
 - Statistics on rainfall, natural disasters, current climate and climate change effects on plants and livelihoods (including the survival, culture, customs and traditional practices of indigenous peoples)

Goal 14: Life Below Water

Concerns:

1. There is no data and plan on tackling the problem of overfishing, river pollution and fish bombing.
2. EPU's strategy only mentions methods for management but not on preservation and conservation of aquatic life.
3. Gazetting marine parks can threaten indigenous areas and livelihoods in coastal areas.

Recommendations:

1. The government should recognize and promote the indigenous *tagal* system.
 2. Data on the *tagal* system as one of the indicators of conservation efforts by communities - this data can be obtained from indigenous NGOs such as PACOS.
- Indicator suggestions:
 - No. of rivers where the *tagal* system has been implemented
 - No. of river and coastal areas that are managed by communities' own committees, working together with other parties that can help in conservation efforts (government agencies, NGOs, CSOs or private sector)
 - No. of conservation projects for coral and other marine life that do not detrimentally affect indigenous rights and livelihoods (free access to waters, rights to roam, usufructuary rights etc.).

- Frequency of river cleaning efforts conducted together (government, community)

Goal 15: Life On Land

Concerns:

1. The EPU plan only shows data from Sabah and Sarawak.
2. The EPU plan only mentions mountain areas. It does not include other important areas of biodiversity such as mangrove, flatlands, wetlands.
3. There is no clear definition regarding life on land.
4. There is no recognition of native customary rights (NCR) and customary land.
5. Gazettement of forest reserves without taking into account indigenous land rights and also their opinions/consent through FPIC.
6. Opening up new areas for cultivation of oil palm, commercial agriculture and forestry.

Recommendations:

1. Basic data should be obtained from available statistics on the destruction of forests, mangroves, wetlands, etc.
2. The government should increase efforts in agroforestry.
3. Efforts must comply with the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD) and the Convention on the International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES) which the Malaysian government has ratified, and in relation to CBD, it must include fair and equitable access and benefit sharing.
4. The government must recognize and support ICCAs (Indigenous Community Conserved Areas) as a way to respect indigenous land rights and at the same time conserve natural resources.
 - Indicator suggestions:
 - Analyze forest quality like what has been done by LIDAR.

- No. of reforestation and afforestation conducted.
- No. of licenses given by the government for the purpose of logging and establishing oil palm estates/commercial forests (should be decreasing).
- No. of land gazetted as indigenous land (should be increasing).
- No. of ICCA areas.

Overall recommendations for the cluster:

- ▶ At the community level, there needs to be leadership gathering/community organization to gather data and give their opinions and reports which will then be sent directly to the EPU (two-way communication, community-based data) - Indigenous data department.
- ▶ Establish a space and channel for communities to voice their problems and complaints.
- ▶ Work together with village leaders and indigenous people in the implementation of the SDGs.
- ▶ NGOs (PACOS, AIPP, JOAS) provide data gathered by indigenous peoples and follow it up to the parties concerned.
- ▶ All data and plans by the government to involve communities and the public to have access to the information (transparency).
- ▶ All plans, initiatives and implementation of SDGs to be in line with Free, Prior, Informed Consent (FPIC) and UNDRIP.
- ▶ Acknowledgement and involvement of NGOs working together with indigenous peoples (PACOS, TONIBUNG, JOAS) in the EPU Working Group.
- ▶ More focus must be given to environmental aspects as well as equity and social justice.
- ▶ There needs to be fair and equitable benefit sharing in every plan and action to achieve the SDG.

3. WELL BEING CLUSTER

Goal 3 - Good Health & Wellbeing

Gaps

- The marginalization of traditional medicine and health practices contributes to the overall decline of maternal and foetal health amongst indigenous peoples.
- The lack of resources channelled to general mental health services as well as to support alternative livelihood initiatives are obstacles for IPs suffering mental health related issues.
- The lack of access to rural clinics due to logistics does not improve the general vaccination rate of IP children

Opportunities

- Support and strengthening of indigenous health practices and traditional medicines can help complement and close the gap on health deficiencies, especially in communities who lack access to mainstream health services and facilities.
- Increasing the capabilities and scope of services of rural clinics increases access of communities to basic healthcare and vaccines
- Channelling more resources to general mental health services and increasing support for alternative livelihood initiatives directly and positively impact IPs with mental health related issues.

Goal 16 - Peace, Justice & Strong Institutions

Gaps

- Political intervention in the appointment of indigenous leaders is a violation of their rights to self-determination.
- The definition of land management and traditional conservation practices of indigenous people are seen as a 'idle land' by government policies that are too focused on economic profit.

- Indigenous peoples' access to the justice system and registration system is blocked by cost, complexity and availability.
- The Native Court institution has been belittled/seen as of lower status when compared to the civil and Shariah system.

Opportunities

- Returning the process of appointing leaders back to the indigenous people will empower their rights to self-determination.
- Recognition of indigenous definition of land management and traditional conservation practices will help in the State's efforts in environmental conservation.
- Removal of barriers to access of justice and registration for IPs will also remove said barriers to general public.
- Acknowledge the importance of the Native Court is at the same level as that of the civil and Shariah system.

4. HUMAN CAPITAL CLUSTER

Goal 4: Quality Education

Goal	Basic Data	Gap	Opportunities	Indicators
Ensure inclusive and fair education as well as encourage life-long learning for indigenous communities	<p>Indigenous peoples who have been left behind in formal education is high because the education system is centralised.</p> <p>Education Department, District</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education services for indigenous peoples is lacking in quality. • Discrimination against indigenous peoples (opportunities to get into higher education institutions). • Lack of special aid for 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provide learning centres and community colleges for youth and women who have been left behind in formal education. • Involvement of indigenous communities in the education system. 	Each village/indigenous community has a community learning centre.

	Education Department, UNICEF	<p>indigenous peoples to further their studies to university.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There are no services in the education system to deal with those who have been left behind. 		
Include indigenous language and curriculum in the education system	District Education Department, UNICEF, State Education Department	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Teachers who have been sent to rural areas do not understand the culture and customs of indigenous peoples. • Teachers are not taken according to educational background (or are unrelated to education field). • Curriculum that is not sensitive to indigenous peoples' customs. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Informal learning is implemented in every village. • Vocational skills that looks at indigenous knowledge is implemented. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There is recognition for Community Learning Centres (CLC) • Indigenous curriculum is included in the national education system. • Implement indigenous language (mother tongue) education in the national education system.
Build and upgrade education facilities that are child, disability and gender sensitive and provide safe, non-violent, inclusive and effective learning		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Infrastructure/basic facilities problems. (Roads, dorms, internet and phone services) • Water, food security, health and safety problems among indigenous children. • Discipline problems and quality 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Allocation of funds from the government to continue Community Learning Centres (CLC). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provide facilities and quality teachers. • Establish centres for children with disabilities in every district.

environments for all		<p>of teachers in rural schools.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lack of attention given to rural education. • There is no centre for disabled people in rural areas 		
----------------------	--	---	--	--

5. INCLUSIVITY CLUSTER

Goal	Basic Data	Gaps	Opportunities & Threats	Indicators
Goal 1: No Poverty				
Target 1.2: Reduce poverty from all angles.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Areas that do not have access to basic necessities such as water, roads and education. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The government has not taken into account the actual needs of rural communities. Data from the communities need to be uploaded into the government's portal. • Poverty is measured based on monthly wage and number of dependants. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increase population census activities. For example, economy, education (in a certain area). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No. of improved facilities in rural areas, especially in terms of access to water, roads and electricity.
Target 1.4: Equal rights to economic resources, including ownership and control over land and natural resources..	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Those who are categorized as hardcore poor do not have recognition of their NCR land 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A lot of indigenous customary lands have been expropriated including forest reserves. For example, for large-scale plantations. • Large-scale agriculture projects 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Government recognition of native customary land (NCR), agricultural practices and traditional knowledge. • Formation of CBEs (community- 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No. of recognized and ownership of customary lands (NCR). • No. of CBEs formed and training conducted by

	and their land titles have not been approved.	in customary lands that are rich in biodiversity obstructs access of indigenous peoples to forest resources and causes the erosion of traditional knowledge - food, language, music, dance, clothing, etc.	based enterprise) and government aid in training on entrepreneurial formation and management.	the government.
Goal 2: Zero Hunger				
Target 2.3 & 2.4: Agricultural productivity and income doubled for small-scale food producers including through safe and fair access to land, and implement sustainable agricultural practices that conserve the natural environment.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Indigenous communities own limited areas of agricultural land. Indigenous communities that practice traditional agricultural systems. Indigenous communities and companies that farm using chemical fertilizers and pesticides (small-scale and large- 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The amount of food produced cannot accommodate all their needs and they are still reliant on imported products and outside food. Traditional agriculture systems are not recognized and do not have special funding. Indigenous communities rely on forest resources for survival. The government promotes the use of chemicals and pesticides to farmers by providing subsidies. Traditional knowledge is increasingly being eroded as 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Government recognition towards sustainable agricultural/integration/conservation practices of communities. Protection of forests for continual food sourcing, and provide training and support/aid. Conduct research and documentation with indigenous communities and academia on the effects of using chemical substances and pesticides. Promote the practice of organic agriculture to communities and companies. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No. of communities practicing sustainable agricultural/integration/conservation practices that are recognized and certified. No. of farms using eco-friendly agricultural systems. No. of trainings conducted and community forests recognized. No. of documentation and research conducted.

	scale plantations).	more indigenous peoples use chemical fertilizers and pesticides.		
Target 2.5: Ensure the genetic diversity of seeds and that there is fair and equitable sharing of benefits from the use of genetic resources and associated traditional knowledge as agreed on by the international community.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Existence of laws/policies governing the entry and exit of traditional seeds. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lack of skills, expertise and technology in handling storage of traditional seeds. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Training for seed storage and creation of seed banks to preserve traditional seeds. Involve indigenous communities in meetings, dialogues and conferences. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No. of trainings conducted and seed banks established. No. of indigenous communities and government agencies involved in jointly organized activities.
Goal 5: Gender Equality				
Target 5.1, 5.2 and 5.3: End discrimination and violence against women and girls.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Different employment opportunities and wages between men and women. JKKK and village leaders in each area. Division of property and participation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Being a housewife is not recognized as an occupation because it does not contribute to the family's economy. Village leaders appointed by the government are usually men. Women are less involved in decision making and division of property between men and women. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The government should help housewives to participate in various sectors. Women should be involved in village leadership. Gender assessments should be done before a project is conducted to gather data on involvement of women in various activities. Indigenous communities are 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No. of women/housewives involved in various sectors. No. of women involved in village leadership and in decision-making.

	between men and women in each activity.		given the freedom to appoint their own village leaders to ensure gender equality is achieved.	
Goal 10: Reduced Inequalities				
Target 10.1,10.2 & 10.3 Empower and promote social, political and economic participation for all, as well as ensuring equal opportunities and reduced inequalities including abolishing laws that are discriminatory.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Low wages with many dependants. • Budget allocation that is based on administration power in an area (Gov & Opposition). • Divide and rule concept. • Initiatives to include indigenous peoples participation should be conducted in 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Current economic systems place more value on money/cash economy rather than subsistence. A great number of indigenous peoples are categorized as hardcore poor (B40). • Indigenous peoples often get threats from the government, if they support the Opposition the budget will be frozen. • Indigenous Peoples are often given remuneration without looking at economic, social, cultural and political sustainability. • Representatives give little emphasis on rights such as the 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Conduct research at the community level to obtain data on hardcore poor groups according to community needs. • Give awareness to the public on the importance of subsistence economy. • Conduct research on subsistence economy systems. • Awareness and increased capabilities of indigenous peoples. • Increased capabilities of communities and awareness to government departments. • Comprehensive research on the needs and aspirations of 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Participation/Consultation of indigenous peoples according to international standards such as the UNDRIP and related laws. • Empower indigenous peoples and do not make them victims of political agendas. • The government should look at the basic needs of indigenous peoples so that they can be more independent. • Change in social status determination policy (the parents can

	<p>accordance with their cultural needs (language) in decision-making.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Self-identity. 	<p>wishes and needs of indigenous peoples.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Initiatives to include indigenous peoples has not been done in a fashion that is appropriate and understandable (language). • Mixed marriages. 	<p>indigenous peoples.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Identity is decided by parents/indigenous peoples in line with UNDRIP and related laws. 	<p>decide).</p>
--	---	--	--	-----------------

MEMBERSHIP SUGGESTIONS

NGOs	CSOs	ACADEMIA	GOV	PRIVATE SECTOR
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • LEAP • SAWO • WWF • SEPA • FOREVER SABAH 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • PACOS • JOAS • PANSAs • TONIBUNG • To earth with love • CLEAR 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • UMS • UITM • Community College 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Native Courts (Sabah, Sarawak) • EPU • Ministry of Rural Development • Department of Agriculture • MAHIN 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Signal hill Eco Farm • FMU stakeholders

1. The EPU should conduct meetings at the state level to ensure the involvement of local NGOs in the SDG implementation.